

ESSAY

Translating Healthcare Simulationist Code of Ethics into Urdu: bridging gaps in Pakistani healthcare simulation

Maria Bajwa^{1,*}, Maliha Zeba Khan^{2,*}

¹Health Professions Education, MGH Institute of Health Professions, Boston, MA, USA

²Department of International Relations, National University of Modern Languages, Islamabad, Pakistan

Corresponding Author: Maria Bajwa, maria1bajwa@gmail.com, mbajwa@mgh.harvard.edu

<https://ijohs.com/article/doi/10.54531/FINN8478>

ABSTRACT

This paper detailed the translation process of the Healthcare Simulationist Code of Ethics from English to Urdu, Pakistan's national language, addressing the need for healthcare simulation in the country's native language. Pakistan, a lower-middle-income country, faces challenges accessing healthcare education in Urdu. The systematic translation by bilingual simulation and social sciences experts considered linguistic and cultural nuances by combining translation by committee and back-translation of selected text. Bilingual experts in linguistic research and healthcare practice verified this translation from healthcare, healthcare simulation and linguistics perspectives. This research contributes to the theoretical understanding of ethical values in healthcare simulation, positively influencing healthcare professionals and educators in Pakistan. The translation sought to enhance access to responsible healthcare training initiatives, specifically targeting remote regions and underserved rural communities. This includes health workers, who serve as the primary conduits for health-related initiatives in these areas.

What this essay adds:

- Establishes the significance of translating healthcare simulation-related documents into other languages, such as Urdu.
- Provides a comprehensive description of the translation process of the Simulationist's Code of Ethics (The Code) while preserving the inspirational values of The Code and cultural and linguistic nuances of the language.
- Sets up precedence for translations of other simulation-related documents from English to Urdu.
- Presents the Urdu translation for The Code, and the words 'simulation' and 'Simulationist'.
- Promotes the understanding and compliance with ethical guidelines and professionalism with simulation-based education and practice.

Submission date: 25 February 2024

Accepted Date: 08 April 2024

Published Date: 13 June 2024

Introduction

Pakistan, a developing country, is gradually embracing more advanced, evidence-based healthcare educational practices, including simulation. Pakistan faces substantial challenges, including restricted human resources and tangible assets for healthcare education and practice [1], antiquated curricula [2], and scarcity of healthcare simulation resources in Urdu, the nation's native language [3]. These challenges impede high-quality, easily accessible healthcare education and care [1]. Additionally, these challenges hinder the adoption of simulation-based healthcare education, an established technique for improving patient outcomes [4]. Despite the growing recognition of the effectiveness of healthcare simulation, its utilization in Pakistan remains limited due to the scarcity of Urdu-language simulation education, research and practice materials, [3] impeding its widespread adoption. It ultimately hinders improved patient care in Pakistan, highlighting a critical area for improvement in advancing healthcare simulation education and practice in Pakistan.

Healthcare simulation

Healthcare simulation, or simulation, is an educational technique that replaces or amplifies real experiences with guided experiences that evoke or replicate substantial aspects of the real world in a fully interactive manner [5]. As simulation has evolved, most of the work was generated and published in the global north [6], indicated by major simulation initiatives, such as simulation societies [7,8], Simulation Glossary [9], Healthcare Simulation Standards of Best Practice [10] and the Simulationist's Code of Ethics (The Code) [11]. English is the primary research language, driven by its global ubiquity [12] and its status as the native language in the geographical regions where these initiatives originated.

The Simulationist's Code of Ethics

Under Dr. Park's leadership, the Code was developed with the help of 55 experts from six continents to ensure the ethical practice of healthcare simulation [11]. Adapting an ethical code requires accepting the responsibilities and accountabilities associated with that field [13]. Healthcare simulation practitioners realized the need for an overarching governing document containing ethical constructs and guidelines for the expanding field of healthcare simulation. While the Code was written in English, the need for its translation into various languages has emerged to facilitate its effective utilization and dissemination worldwide, leading to its translation to 11 languages to the date of starting this project. The Code presents six aspirational values: (1) Integrity, (2) Transparency, (3) Mutual Respect, (4) Professionalism, (5) Accountability and (6) Results Orientation [11].

History of Urdu language

Pakistan's bilingual education system, rooted in pre-independence history from British Colonial Rule, traces back to Lord Macaulay's 1835 decree favoring English for administration, judiciary, and education, sidelining

indigenous languages [14, p. 47; 15, p. 7]. The colonial regime developed local vernaculars to placate indigenous language speakers, fostering linguistic identities [16]. This linguistic dichotomy persisted post-independence (1947), leading to continued divided education into English for elites and Urdu for the rest of the population [14]. English's prominence, tied to job prospects and social status, has persisted, exemplifying the enduring legacy of colonial language policies in post-independence Pakistan [16].

Currently, in early education, Urdu serves as the main instructional medium in public educational institutions; at the same time, high-priced private schools and colleges, mostly in urban areas, primarily use English [14]. Higher education syllabi are in English, but teaching occurs in Urdu. This linguistic dynamic persists in healthcare settings, where Urdu is comfortably employed due to lifelong usage [14]. Non-urban regions predominantly use Urdu, emphasizing the need for text and education in the same language for optimal comprehension, adaptation and accessibility [14]. Inaccessibility to English-medium private institutions compounds educational disparities for most of the population in urban and non-urban regions. Consequently, the healthcare professionals originating from these areas and working in those areas find it difficult to comprehend the text provided in the English language.

Significance of translation

Individuals grasp information more effectively in their native language [17]. Translating content into the local language empowers local experts to apply knowledge in their context, fostering experimentation and knowledge building [18, p. 2–21]. This intervention facilitates global sustainable social development, engaging the public in exploring new constructs [18, p. 2–21]. Translation also proves vital for policy-makers, expanding document outreach and accessibility to the wider population [19]. In essence, translation emerges as a powerful tool, advancing research, societal engagement and policy effectiveness in a global context. At the same time, translating healthcare documents can be costly [20]. While services like artificial intelligence, Microsoft Translator [21] and Google Translator [22] exist, they lack linguistic and cultural nuances, risking meaning loss [17,23]. Precise human translation is imperative for maintaining the integrity of critical documents like the Code.

Aim

This project aimed to translate the Code into Urdu, ensuring cultural and linguistic precision while accurately representing ethical principles. This research paper documents the English-to-Urdu translation process, offering insights into challenges, guiding similar translations of significant documents and contributing to cross-cultural communication.

Methods

The literature provides diverse methods for translating documents, ranging in rigor. Evaluation and assessment instruments demand heightened accuracy and precision in

Table 1: Linguistic delicacies: examples of words requiring special focus during translation

English word	Urdu translation
Simulation	Tamseel kari
Healthcare simulation experts	'Maahereen-e-tamseel kari baraey hifzaan-e-sehat'
Healthcare simulationists	'Tamseel karaan-e-hifzaan-e-sehat'
Integrity	'Diyanat daari' or 'Saalmiyat' (depending on the context of the conversation)
Inspirational	Mutayyana, or baa-maqsid- context decided that it would be mutayyana
Privacy	'Raazdaari' – The word for both privacy and confidentiality is the same, used interchangeably, and it is difficult to distinguish between these concepts. So, it was left as 'raazdaari'.
Transparency	'Shaffaafiyat' is the translation for transparency, but this is the same translation for another English word, 'clarity'. Therefore, to capture the meaning of transparency, the word 'wazaahat' was added, which means 'explanation' in English.
Evaluation	Translated literally to 'Jannchna' which did not fit into the context and flow of the language.
Deception (in simulation)	Translated to the word: 'dhoka dahi' which has a bad connotation and does not capture what it means in simulation. So, with mutual agreement, the word 'Khufiya' was used, which explained it better and went well with the context.
Empathy and compassion	No exact translation was found, so used approximate words of 'humdardi' and 'Murawwat' were used.
Beneficence and non-maleficence	No exact translation was found, so used approximate words 'shafqat' and 'Nawazish' were used.
Professionalism	The exact translation, 'paysha warraiyat' was insufficient to capture the meaning. So, it was changed to 'paysha warrana slaahiyat', meaning 'professional capabilities' in English.
Submit themselves	No exact word in Urdu that would capture the meaning. So an approximate phrase, 'hama waqt tayyar aur dastiyaab' was used
The entire last sentence of 'Accountability'	The construct of the entire sentence was difficult to translate exactly without losing the meaning. So, an approximate translation was done to capture the content and emphasize the focal point.
Results Orientation	This term required in-depth discussion and an explanation of the context behind the word and how it applies to the simulation world before appropriate translation.
'Outcomes are inclusive of all parts of the process of healthcare simulation. They are not exclusive to a final product'.	Due to a complex structure, the exact translation of this sentence was impossible without losing its focus leading to several attempts of translation before choosing the final one.

relevance. The experts' review indicated the translated code's high accuracy and acceptability.

Critical review for semantic equivalence and harmonization

The translator team incorporated the experts' feedback into the translated document before the final review from a senior bilingual social sciences researcher and linguistic specialist. This linguistic specialist assessed the document for accuracy and harmonization to achieve semantic equivalence per cultural nuances and linguistic variations, and his feedback was incorporated.

Obtaining certification

The translated Code's final version maintained the integrity of the original document, ensuring its relevance and applicability among simulation practitioners who communicate using Urdu. The authenticity of the final translated version was certified by the National University of Modern Languages, the English Translation department, which performs professional translations for the Government of Pakistan and various foreign embassies.

Results

The translation process resulted in a successful translation of the Code into Urdu, effectively capturing the principles and values of the original English language code while maintaining its integrity. It can be viewed at the Society of Simulation in Healthcare website [7]. (See [Appendix 1](#) for the Urdu Translation of The Code).

Discussion

The translation process considered linguistic and cultural nuances, ensuring the Code's relevance and appropriateness for people who speak Urdu. The methodical approach to translating the Code into Urdu while preserving its inspirational values resulted in a culturally sensitive and linguistically appropriate version.

Despite the relatively high prevalence of English literacy among Pakistani healthcare professionals in urban areas, Urdu remains their preferred language for comprehension and communication in the community. This raises the question of whether healthcare professionals fully grasp

the Code's values and intent when reading it in English. How do they interpret and integrate the Code's values into their cultural, ethical and professional values? To address this concern, we carefully balanced literal translation with linguistic adaptation, ensuring the Code's core values resonated with the audience speaking Urdu. This was particularly crucial for healthcare professionals in non-urban settings, commonly called health workers, who typically have limited English proficiency and access to translation services.

The translation process demanded thoughtful reflection on Urdu's linguistic history within the context of colonial rule. To prevent misunderstandings associated with English-speaking colonial rule, the team approached the translated Code cautiously, a consideration highlighted in the critical review stage (10th step "Critical review for semantic equivalence and harmonization"). For instance, translating the term 'deception' into Urdu posed challenges due to historical connotations and public perception linked to English-speaking British rule. This intricacy is especially notable when dealing with another English-language document that discusses deception (Table 1). This attention to cultural sensitivity ensured that the Code's message resonated with the target audience without compromising its original intent.

Several items can be lost or misleading when translated into another language, a fact highlighted during the translation process. We found several ways a particular word in the Code can be translated or did not find an appropriate word. The exact word-for-word meaning would not capture the intent, tone or essence of that sentence and notion, as evidenced by the literature [17]. A deeper understanding of the concept helped us explain it to the linguistic experts to assign the most appropriate equivalent word, exemplified by the word 'deception' in the Code. Moreover, one of the most significant challenges encountered during the translation process was the lack of a precise Urdu equivalent for 'healthcare simulation'. To address this gap, the team delved into deeper discussion and, through back-and-forth translation, coined the term '*tamseel kari baraey hifzaan-e-sehat*' which accurately captures the simulation concept in Urdu.

Healthcare simulation is relatively new to the Pakistani healthcare education landscape; therefore, it must be established on the right foundation. The availability of the Code in Urdu sets up the precedence for forthcoming simulation-related initiatives. Moreover, presenting simulation-related concepts in Urdu might assist healthcare professionals in managing their cognitive load from planning to execution of simulation-based education. They can readily integrate this new knowledge into their existing one, a fact highlighted by Ahmed et al., 'To emphasize, we suggest modification of teaching methods in the language which he or she understands and repeat courses stressing on practical skills' [3].

Challenges and limitations

Our work demonstrated that the cross-language translation process demands a substantial investment of time, financial resources, patience, and a profound understanding of the

content, language and culture, which resonates with the literature [25,27]. Specific challenges included coordinating with global researchers in different time zones, continuous and timely access to libraries, digital or otherwise, for literature and dictionaries, availability of electricity and internet in Pakistan, and finding linguistic specialists with authentic translating experience – specifically, prior work with research articles and government/non-government documents as proof of linguistic specialists' proficiency. Limitations include a lack of a local practising simulationist in the team and a potential oversight of cultural nuances; however, due to the project's broad scope and lack of funding, this was beyond our purview.

Strengths and future implications

A notable strength lies in the translation team members' expertise in simulation, healthcare, translation and bilingual research. Additionally, the method was rooted in evidence and literature, as described earlier. This initiative provides a pathway for more Urdu translations in simulation-related research, contributing to advancing healthcare simulation practices in these communities. To ensure the Code's successful implementation, we recommend establishing training programmes, workshops and educational resources in Urdu that guide the practical application of the Code in simulation-related activities. These activities will enable simulationists who communicate in Urdu to understand and abide by the ethical guidelines while conducting simulation-based activities and decision-making in the simulation field. We anticipate enhanced understanding and compliance with ethical guidelines, professionalism, simulation-based education and practice.

Conclusion

This paper outlines the translation process, introducing the Code in Urdu and fostering ethical practices among healthcare simulationists in regions where Urdu is the communication language, notably Pakistan. This localized version enhances accessibility and outreach to remote areas and furthers ethically sound simulation-related education, especially to health workers. Through this project, we attempted to bridge the language barrier, paving the way for its wider adoption and implementation in the Pakistani healthcare simulation landscape. This achievement will undoubtedly contribute to the advancement of evidence-based practices and the overall improvement of patient care in Pakistan.

Acknowledgements

The authors thank Dr. Hani Lababidi, Dr. Andrew Spain, Dr. Christina Park and Dr. Debra Nestel for their time and guidance at the IMSH 2023 and Dr. Rami Ahmed for critically reviewing this research paper. The authors also thank Mr. Usama Hameed, Research Officer, International Relations & Strategic Affairs, Institute of Policy Studies, Islamabad, for assistance in editing the final Urdu version of the Code. Additionally, the authors thank the following experts for their assistance in the translation process and critically reviewing the translated version of the Code:

- 1) Mr. Syed Nadeem Farhat, LLB (Hons) Shariah and Law, Masters in International Law, Research Fellow and Editor at the Institute of Policy Studies, Islamabad, Associate Editor, Policy Perspectives (biannual research journal), Associate Editor, Maghrib aur Islam (biannual academic journal on civilizational discourses), Pakistan.
- 2) Mr. Arif Jamshaid, MA English Literature, Media and Communication professional skilled in editing, copywriting, and research work, Institute of Policy Studies, Islamabad, Pakistan.
- 3) Dr. Abdul Munim Khan, General Surgeon and Nephrologist, Medical Director Millat Hospital (Pvt.) LTD. Pakistan.

Declarations

Authors' contribution

MB conceived the study and collaborated with MZK on the planning and design. MZK and MB guided the translation process. Both authors conducted analyses of disputed words, engaging in regular meetings with linguistic specialists. MB and MZK jointly authored the manuscript. All authors have followed the instructions for authors and have read and approved the manuscript.

Funding

There were no sources of funding for this study.

Availability of data and materials

None declared.

Ethics approval and consent to participate

None declared.

Competing interests

There are no conflicts of interest to disclose.

References

1. GBD 2019 Pakistan Collaborators. The state of health in Pakistan and its provinces and territories, 1990–2019: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2019. *Lancet Global Health*. 2023 Feb;11(2):e229–e243. Available from: <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/36669807/>. [Accessed 14 September 2023].
2. Saqib SU, Memon AH, Saleem O, Shariff AH. Current standards of postgraduate surgical education and training in Pakistan: time to bridge the gaps in lieu of national necessity. *Journal of the Pakistan Medical Association*. 2021;71(1(Suppl 1)):S56–S60. Available from: https://ecommons.aku.edu/pakistan_fhs_mc_surg_gen/108. [Accessed 18 June 2023].
3. Ahmed M, Ahmad M, Malak A. Finding effectiveness of teaching basic life support to paramedics. *Pakistan Armed Forces Medical Journal*. 2014 Jun 30;64(2):225–228. Available from: <https://www.pafmj.org/index.php/PAFMJ/article/view/677/542>. [Accessed 25 November 2023].
4. McGaghie WC, Draycott TJ, Dunn WF, Lopez CM, Stefanidis D. Evaluating the impact of simulation on translational patient outcomes. *Simulation in Healthcare*. 2011 Aug;6(Suppl):S42–S47. Available from: <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/21705966/>. [Accessed 02 September 2023].
5. Gaba DM. The future vision of simulation in health care. *BMJ Quality & Safety*. 2004;13(suppl 1):i2–i10. Available from: https://qualitysafety.bmj.com/content/13/suppl_1/i2. [Accessed 26 August 2023].
6. Collyer FM. Global patterns in the publishing of academic knowledge: global north, global south. *Current Sociology*. 2018 Jan;66(1):56–73. Available from: <https://www.deepdyve.com/lp/sage/global-patterns-in-the-publishing-of-academic-knowledge-global-north-G6K3iI00Ik?key=sage>. [Accessed 11 June 2023].
7. Society for Simulation in Healthcare. 2023. Available from: <https://www.ssih.org/>. [Accessed 18 June 2023].
8. Society for Simulation in Europe. 2023. Available from: <https://www.sesam-web.org/>. [Accessed 18 June 2023].
9. Molloy MA, Holt J, Charnetski M, Rossler K. Healthcare simulation standards of best Practice™ simulation glossary. *Clinical Simulation in Nursing*. 2021 Sep 1;58:57–65. Available from: [https://www.nursingsimulation.org/article/S1876-1399\(21\)00104-3/pdf](https://www.nursingsimulation.org/article/S1876-1399(21)00104-3/pdf). [Accessed 25 March 2023].
10. Watts PI, Rossler K, Bowler F, Miller C, Charnetski M, Decker S, Molloy MA, Persico L, McMahon E, McDermott D, Hallmark B. Onward and upward: Introducing the healthcare simulation standards of best Practice™. *Clinical Simulation in Nursing*. 2021 Sep 1;58:1–4. Available from: <https://scholars.duke.edu/publication/1497443>. [Accessed 25 March 2023].
11. Park CS, Murphy TF, & the Code of Ethics Working Group. Healthcare Simulationist Code of Ethics. 2018. Available from: <http://www.ssih.org/Code-of-Ethics>. [Accessed 23 March 2023].
12. Szmigiera M. Most spoken languages in the world [Internet]. Statista. 2023. Available from: <https://www.statista.com/statistics/266808/the-most-spoken-languages-worldwide/>. [Accessed 18 June 2023].
13. Oren TI. Rationale for a code of professional ethics for simulationists. Summer Computer Simulation Conference. 2002 July 14–19;428–433. Available from: https://www.site.uottawa.ca/~oren/pubs/D84_Rationale.pdf. [Accessed 18 June 2023].
14. Javed, F. A historical perspective of Pakistan's language in education policy. *Language in India*. 2017 Aug 8;17(8):45–55. Available from: <http://www.languageinindia.com/aug2017/fareehalanguagepolicypakistan1.pdf>. [Accessed 18 June 2023].
15. Rahman T. Language planning and politics in Pakistan (Research Report Series #9). Sustainable Development Policy Institute. 1995. Available from: <https://sdpi.org/sdpiweb/publications/files/R9-Language%20Planning%20and%20Politics%20in%20Pakistan.pdf>. [Accessed 18 June 2023].
16. Rahman T. The medium of instruction controversy in Pakistan. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*. 1997 May 1;18(2):145–154.
17. Khan IA, Khan A, Nazir B, Hussain SS, Khan FG, Khan IA. Urdu translation: the validation and reliability of the 120-item Big Five IPIP Personality Scale. *Current Psychology*. 2019 Dec;38(6):1530+. Available from: <https://go.gale.com/ps/i.do?p=EAIM&u=anon~9aa5f5b7&id=GALE|A608642929&v=2.1&it=r&sid=sitemap&asid=5370bd7e>. [Accessed 23 June 2023].

18. Ji M, Laviosa S. Translation and social practices. The oxford handbook of translation and social practices. Oxford: Oxford University Press. 2020. p. 2–21. Available from: <https://ses.library.usyd.edu.au/bitstream/handle/2123/29203/The%20Oxford%20Handbook%20of%20Translation%20and%20Social%20Practices.pdf?sequence=2>. [Accessed 18 June 2023].
19. Ziegler M, Bensch D. Lost in translation: thoughts regarding the translation of existing psychological measures into other languages. European Journal of Psychological Assessment. 2013 Apr 5; 29(2):81. Available from: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/263917340_Lost_in_Translation_Thoughts_Regarding_the_Translation_of_Existing_Psychological_Measures_Into_Other_Languages. [Accessed 18 June 2023].
20. Ehlon. The cost and benefits of professional translation [Internet]. 2023. Available from: <https://ehlon.com/magazine/translation-rates-costs-benefits/>. [Accessed 18 June 2023].
21. Microsoft Translator Blog. Translate full documents with document translation — now in general availability. 2021. Available from: <https://www.microsoft.com/en-us/translator/blog/2021/05/25/translate-full-documents-with-document-translation-%E2%80%95-now-in-general-availability/>. [Accessed 17 June 2023].
22. Google Translate. Understand your world and communicate across languages. Available from: <https://translate.google.com/about/>. [Accessed 17 June 2023].
23. Van Nes F, Abma T, Jonsson H, Deeg D. Language differences in qualitative research: is meaning lost in translation?. European Journal of Ageing. 2010 Dec;7:313–316. Available from: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/49735080_Language_differences_in_qualitative_research_Is_meaning_lost_in_translation.
24. Imsh2023.org. IMSH: Society for Simulation in Healthcare. A standard of excellence. 2023. Available from: <https://www.ssih.org/Portals/48/Images/Urdu%20Translation%20Updated%202021-02-24.pdf>. [Accessed 16 January 2024].
25. Khan LA. Translation and culture: a comparative analysis of English idioms and proverbs with their Urdu translations. Pakistan Journal of Language and Translation Studies. 2014; 1:58–83. Available from: https://www.academia.edu/36079396/Translation_and_Culture_A_Comparative_Analysis_of_English_Idioms_and_Proverbs_with_their_Urdu_Translations.
26. Maxwell B. Translation and cultural adaptation of the survey instruments. Third International Mathematics and Science Study (TIMSS) Technical Report. 1996;1:159–169. Available from: <https://timssandpirls.bc.edu/timss1995i/TIMSSPDF/TRCHP8.PDF>. [Accessed 17 June 2023].
27. Choi J, Kushner KE, Mill J, Lai DW. Understanding the language, the culture, and the experience: translation in cross-cultural research. International Journal of Qualitative Methods. 2012 Dec;11(5):652–665. Available from: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/262972499_Understanding_the_Language_the_Culture_and_the_Experience_Translation_in_Cross-Cultural_Research.